

UN PARTNERSHIP FOR ACTION ON GREEN ECONOMY

GENDER MAINSTREAMING IN GREEN DEVELOPMENT POLICY OF MONGOLIA



FINAL DRAFT

5 DECEMBER 2016

Contents

LIIST OF ABBREVIATIONS	2
GLOSSARY	4
CHAPTER 1. GENDER ANALYSIS	5
National norms on gender equality	5
Laws and policies.....	8
Gender Equality in political, economic, social and cultural spheres	10
Gender Based Violence.....	15
Conclusion on key gender inequalities.....	16
Rapid assessment of sectors.....	17
CHAPTER 2. METHODS AND TOOLS FOR GENDER ANALYSIS	20
CHAPTER 3. ANALYSIS OF GREEN DEVELOPMENT POLICY THROUGH GENDER EQUALITY PERSPECTIVE	22
CHAPTER 4: PROPOSED GENDER MAINSTREAMING STRATEGY FOR GREEN DEVELOPMENT POLICY	27
CHAPTER 5. GENDER INFORMATION REQUIRED FOR POLICY PLANNING....	31
ANNEX 1. LIST OF LITERATURE	41
ANNEX 2. SAMPLE QUESTIONNAIRE.....	43
ANNEX 3: LIST OF INTERVIEWEES.....	44

LIIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

ADB	Asian Development Bank
ASM	Artisanal Small-scale Mining
CEDAW	Convention on the Elimination of all Forms of Discrimination Against Women
CSO	Civil Society Organization
DHS	Demographic Household Survey
FAO	Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations
GBA+	Gender-based Analysis Plus
GBV	Gender Based Violence
GDP	Green Development Policy of Mongolia
GEL	Gender Equality Law
GIZ	Gesellschaft für Internationale Zusammenarbeit
GRB	Gender Responsive Budgeting
ICT	Information and Communications Technology
ILO	International Labour Organization
JICA	Japan International Cooperation Agency
LPGE	Law on Promoting Gender Equality
MAPS	Mainstreaming, Accelerating and Policy Support for SDGS
MICS	Multiple Indicator Cluster Survey
MNG	Mongolia
MET	Ministry of Environment and Tourism
NA	Not applicable
NAP	National Action Plan
NCAV	National Center Against Violence
NCG	National Council on Gender
NGO	Non-governmental Organization
NHRC	National Human Rights Commission
NRSOM	National Registration Statistics Office (present NSO)
NSO	National Statistics Office (former NRSOM)
PPP	Purchasing Power Parity
REDD	Reducing Emission from Deforestation and Forest Degradation

SME	Small and Medium-sized Enterprise
SDC	Swiss Agency for Development and Cooperation
SDG	Sustainable Development Goals
TAF	The Asia Foundation
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme
UNESCAP	United Nations Economic and Social Commission for Asia and the Pacific
UNFPA	United Nations Population Fund
UNIDO	United Nations Industrial Development Organization
UN Women	United Nations Entity for Gender Equality and Women's Empowerment
WB	World Bank

GLOSSARY¹

Gender: The socially constructed roles and relationships, personality traits, attitudes, behaviours, values, relative power and influence that society ascribes to the two sexes on a differential basis. Gender is relational and refers not simply to women or men but to the relationship between them.

Sex: The biological characteristics that define humans as female or male.

Gender roles: A set of prescriptions for action and behaviour assigned to men and women by society according to cultural norms and traditions.

Gender identity: Women's and men's gender identity determines how they are perceived and positioned in a society, and how they are expected to think and act along traditional views of masculinities and femininities.

Gender equality: Gender equality entails the concept that all human beings, both women and men, are free to develop their personal abilities and make choices without the limitations set by stereotypes, rigid gender roles or prejudices. Gender equality means that the different behaviours, aspirations and needs of women and men are reconsidered, valued and favoured equally.

Gender equity: Fairness and justice in the distribution of responsibilities and benefits between women and men. To ensure fairness, temporary positive measures must often be put in place to compensate for the historical and social disadvantages that prevent women and men from operating on a level playing field. Equity is a justice-based means—equality is the human rights-based result.

Women's empowerment: The process of gaining access and developing women's capacities with a view to participating actively in shaping one's own life and that of one's community in economic, social and political terms.

Gender mainstreaming: The process of assessing the implications for women and men of any planned action, including legislation, policies or programmes, in any area and at all levels. It is a strategy for making women's as well as men's concerns and experiences an integral dimension in the design, implementation, monitoring and evaluation of policies and programmes in all political, economic and social spheres.

Practical and strategic gender needs and interests: Practical gender needs are identified by women as a response to an immediate perceived necessity, and usually relate to inadequacies in living conditions such as water provision, health care and employment. Strategic gender interests tend to challenge gender divisions of power and control, and traditionally defined norms and roles

¹Gender Mainstreaming in Development Programming, UN Women, 2014

CHAPTER 1. GENDER ANALYSIS

Methodology: Desk review of available government reports, NSO data, studies by development agencies, non-governmental organisations, interviews with key informants from government, research institutions, development partners. The normative and policy framework analysis was adopted from guidance materials by UN ESCAP, UNIDO and UN Women.

National norms on gender equality²**A. Poverty, participation on productive activities and participation in unremunerated productive work**

1. Extent of commitment to gender mainstreaming
 - 1.1. Law on Promoting Gender Equality (LPGE) establishes the principle of gender sensitive policy making and requires mainstreaming gender into development policy through integrating gender issues into national laws, policies, programmes, plans and projects (LPGE, Art 5.1.4.).
 - 1.2. The LPGE demands the institutionalisation of gender mainstreaming into subnational and local level planning processes under Articles 19 and 20, as national and local governments must “introduce a methodology to incorporate gender considerations in local and sectoral policies, general strategies, programs and projects; to conduct gender analysis of drafts of these documents and review and comment on their reports” (GEL, Art 19.1.1). The local self-governing bodies must incorporate state gender policies and regulations in local economic and social development policies, to monitor their implementation and allocate funds (GEL, Art 20.1.1 and 20.1.2)
 - 1.3. There is no legal requirement to review all new legislation from a gender perspective, although the Parliament has a mandate to ensure that “state policies and legislations are defined in gender equality and rights based manner” (LPGE, Art 15.1.1.).
2. Extent of commitment to gender budgeting
 - 2.1. There is a provision in the LPGE, Art 16.1.1 requiring the Cabinet to introduce a system of gender budgeting. Sectors and local governments are required to allocate funds for promotion of gender equality in their respective domains (LPGE, Art 16.1.1, 13.2, 10.3).
3. Extent of commitment to gender responsive statistics
 - 3.1. Despite the law on statistics does not have a provision on gender statistics, the LPGE mandates the Cabinet to create conditions for compilation of sex disaggregated statistics, to have gender equality assessments carried out, to disseminate the findings to customers and the public (LPGE, Art 16.1.1); the local and central government agencies compile local or sector-wide sex-disaggregated statistics and to assess the state of gender equality and policy impacts (LPGE, Art 19.1.2); and the Civil Service Council must set up a structure that compiles sex disaggregated statistics for civil service and to provide the State Great Khural, the President, the Cabinet and other interested parties with this data and information (LPGE, Art 21.1.1).
 - 3.2. Existence of gender unit in the National Statistics Office: the Social Statistics unit in the Demography and Social Statistics Department of the National Statistical Office is responsible for gender statistics.
 - 3.3. Existence of national plan of action on gender statistics or gender statistics is explicitly covered in the national plan of action on statistics: The Midterm Strategy and Action Plan for the implementation of the LPGE for 2013-2016 contains an Objective to develop gender statistics, establish an integrated database and ensure the use at all levels of policy development.
4. Extent of commitment to gender equality in employment
 - 4.1. Mongolia ratified the ILO convention No 100 concerning equal remuneration for men and women workers for work of equal value

² Core set of Gender Indicators for Asia and the Pacific region, ESCAP, 2015

4.2. Mongolia ratified the ILO convention No 111 concerning discrimination with respect of employment and occupation in 1969.

5. Extent of commitment to support reconciliation of work and family life

5.1. Mongolia has not ratified the ILO convention No 156 concerning equal opportunities and equal treatment for men and women workers: workers with family responsibilities;

5.2. Mongolia has not ratified the ILO convention No 175 concerning part-time work;

5.3. Mongolia has not ratified the ILO convention No 177 concerning home work;

5.4. Mongolia has not ratified the ILO convention No 183 concerning the revision of the maternity protection convention (revised).

5.5. The length of maternity leave: 120 days (Labour Law, Art 104.1)

5.6. The percentage of wages paid during maternity leave: Persons who contributed to social insurance under labour contracts and civil servants receive 100 per cent of average wage (on the basis of last 12 months of paid employment). Persons who contribute to the voluntary social insurance scheme are entitled to 70 per cent of average wage during last 12 months (Social Insurance Law, Article 19).

B. In area of governance and participation in public life and decision making

6. Extent of country commitment to gender equality and women's empowerment

6.1. National women's machinery established in the government: The National Council on Gender Equality was established in 2000, later renamed National Committee for Gender Equality in 2005 with expanded mandate.

6.2. Extent of participation of women's machinery in decision making at the highest level of government (Cabinet): Renewed composition of National Committee on Gender was approved by the Cabinet decision No35 in February 2015. According to that decision, the chair of NCG was the Prime Minister, Deputy Chair was the Minister of Labour and Social Protection. The members of the NCG were Minister of Health, deputy ministers or state secretaries of eight ministries, deputy director of NSO, Chair of the Parliamentary Standing Committee on Social Affairs, deputy head of the Ulaanbaatar City Administration, Human rights commissioner of the NHRC, representatives of which women's and men's civil society organisations and networks, media. This composition is subject for renewal after completion of formation of new government in July-September 2016.

6.3. Presence of gender quota for parliament: No

6.4. Presence of gender quota for local government: No

6.5. Presence of gender quota for parliament (voluntary political party quotas): the quota of 20% is set for male or female candidates nominated by a political party (Law on Election, 2015, amended in May 2016)

C. Areas of human rights of women and girls

6.1. There are no reservations to the Convention on Elimination of all Forms of Discrimination Against Women

6.2. Law to Combat Domestic Violence (2004), revised in 2016, currently pending re-approval by the Parliament elected in June 2016

6.3. Existence of data on violence against women from a national survey conducted within last 10 years: The first national survey on domestic violence will be carried out by NSO in 2017.

6.4. Inheritance rights do not discriminate against women and girls (Civil Code, Art 520)

6.5. Legal minimum age at marriage is 18 for men and women (Law on Family, Art 6.1)

6.6. Status of ratification of the 18 core international human rights treaties and optional protocols³

³<http://indicators.ohchr.org/> Accessed on 19 Sep 2016

Table 1. Status of ratification of the 18 core international human rights treaties and optional protocols

Human Rights Instrument : (Date into force)	Ratification Status
International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination :1969	Signature: 1966, Ratification/Accession: 1969
International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights :1976	Signature: 1968, Ratification/Accession: 1974
Optional Protocol to the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights :1976	Signature: NA, Ratification/Accession: 1991
Second Optional Protocol to the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, aiming at the abolition of the death penalty :1991	Signature: NA, Ratification/Accession: 2012
International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights :1976	Signature: 1968, Ratification/Accession: 1974
Optional Protocol to the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights :2013	Signature: 2009, Ratification/Accession: 2010
Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women :1981	Signature: 1980, Ratification/Accession: 1981
Optional Protocol to the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women: 2000	Signature: 2000, Ratification/Accession: 2002
Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment :1987	Signature: NA, Ratification/Accession: 2002
Optional Protocol to the Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment :2006	Signature: 2013, Ratification/Accession: 2015
Convention on the Rights of the Child :1990	Signature: 1990, Ratification/Accession: 1990
Optional Protocol to the Convention on the Rights of the Child on the involvement of children in armed conflict :2002	Signature: 2001, Ratification/Accession: 2004
Optional Protocol to the Convention on the Rights of the Child on the sale of children, child prostitution and child pornography :2002	Signature: 2001, Ratification/Accession: 2003
Optional Protocol to the Convention on the Rights of the Child on a communications procedure: 2014	Signature: 2013, Ratification/Accession: 2015
International Convention on the Protection of the Rights of All Migrant Workers and Members of their Families: 2003	Signature: NA, Ratification/Accession: NA
Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities: 2008	Signature: NA, Ratification/Accession: 2009

Optional Protocol to the Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities: 2008	Signature: NA, Ratification/Accession: 2009
International Convention for the Protection of all Persons from Enforced Disappearance: 2010	Signature: 2007, Ratification/Accession: 2015

Laws and policies

The above normative framework outlines compliance of national legislation with the core set of gender indicators adopted by UN ESCAP in 2015. Mongolia’s Constitution, laws and policies provide broader legal basis for gender equality. As concluded by the research team of IRIM⁴, the legal and policy framework of country is “comparatively comprehensive and the gender issues are taken into account in major national and sectoral policies and programmes”.

The Constitution of Mongolia (1992) enshrines equality between men and women in the political, economic, social, cultural life and in family relations in Article 16 and states that everyone shall be free from any type of ethnicity, language, race, age, sex, social status, wealth, employment, position, religious belief, viewpoint, and educational level in Article 14.

Law on Promotion of Gender Equality (2011) guarantees gender equality in political, legal, economic, social, cultural fields and family relations. It sets out specific responsibilities of various public agencies in implementation of the law.

Law Against Domestic Violence (2004) was revised in 2015-16 in close consultations with civil society advocates and is set to be adopted by the new parliament. Comprehensive changes were proposed to provide a holistic, multi-disciplinary services to survivors of violence. A number of new measures will be introduced to improve the protection of victims such as restraining orders for perpetrators, mandatory behaviour change programmes and punishment. The role of police is clearly identified. Most importantly, amendments bring to focus the measures on primary preventions, identifies the role of community members in reporting domestic violence and the role of community councils in identifying and developing solutions. The LADV is harmonised with the Criminal Code, Law on Law Enforcement, Law on Administrative Violations, Law on Criminal Procedure, Law on Marshal’s Service and the Law on Victim and Witness Protection.

Criminal Code (2008) defines human trafficking and rape as crimes. An amendment to codify domestic violence as a crime is currently pending at the Parliament. If adopted, the revised Criminal Code amendment will eliminate “revenge provision” and acknowledge the legitimacy of self-defence. According to this provision, women who were charged with revenge provision will have their sentences reassessed by courts. Also amendments are proposed to the *Criminal Procedural Law* seeking elimination of legal barriers to victims of gender based violence to seek justice.

Civil Code (2002) states equal rights of daughters and sons to inherit property (Article 520), female and male surviving spouses have equal inheritance rights to property (Article 520), unmarried men and unmarried women have equal ownership rights to property, similarly, married men and married women have equal ownership right to property (Arts 127.2, 128.1).

Labour Law (1999) bans gender based discrimination in employment, and provides protection to pregnant and nursing mothers. The law does not mandate equal pay for the work of equal value for men and women.

⁴Gender Overview – Mongolia. A desk study. SDC and IRIM, 2015

Law on Family (1999) regulates issues pertinent to marriage, divorce and divorce settlement, property ownership of family members, adoption and custody of children. It grants equal rights and responsibilities in marriage to husbands and wives. Divorce is not allowed in case of wife's pregnancy and if there is a child under age of one.

Law on Health (2011) provides the right to primary health care, maternal and child care regardless of socio-economic status and health insurance coverage.

Law on Education (2002, amended in 2006) states equal rights to education for all citizens regardless of race, ethnicity, sex, religion, disability, social and economic status. The educational facilities must be free of discrimination and psychological or corporal punishment.

Law on Combatting Trafficking in persons (2012) sets the responsibilities of law enforcement agencies, measures for protection of rights and dignity of victims. However, lack of regulations and procedures to guide its implementation and National Anti-Trafficking Plan of Action has been the reason for inadequate implementation of the law. Many victims left unidentified and vulnerable to being penalised.

Law on Social Welfare (2012) defines retirement age for women to be 55 and for men 60 when they can start receiving full benefits (Article 12.1.1). Women who are below age of 45 and men below age 50 have at least four children under the age of 18 and who are "single head of household" are also entitled to social welfare benefits (Article 12.1.5)

Law on Parliament Election (amended 2016) as mentioned above the gender quota originally set for 30% among political party candidates was reduced to 20 % prior to election of 2016. Similar amendment was made in 2012 explained by lack of women candidates in political parties to fill the 30% quota.

Law on Child care service (2015) addresses lack of child care facilities by providing legal basis for private child cares services and creation of jobs for women care workers, previously engaged in informal care sector.

Policies

The mid-term Strategy and Action Plan for the implementation of the Law on Promotion of Gender Equality for 2013-2016 defined the goals and six strategic objectives. The Goals of the Strategy aimed to strengthen the national mechanism for the implementation of the LPGE, develop capacities for law implementation at sectoral and local levels, mainstream gender equality concepts in all policies and processes; ensure the multi-stakeholder engagement of civil society, media and the private sector in law implementation, establish resource and funding stability and ensure the coordination of international cooperation.

Some progress towards these ambitious goals was reported by the Ministry of Population Development and Social Protection in May 2016. Also, main achievements were presented to the CEDAW Committee in February 2016. The Committee expressed concern that the new legislative reforms for the advancement of women lack adequate resources for their implementation and accountability and urged the government to establish strong accountability mechanisms, allocate adequate human, technical and financial resources for the implementation of laws in accordance with the women's rights under the Constitution and CEDAW.

The midterm strategy has laid preparatory work for gender mainstreaming into sectoral and local development plans. The following key achievements were presented by the Ministry in 2016:

- Capacity strengthening on gender equality: The Ministry reported an increased national capacity for gender analysis with creation of a consortium of gender experts which carried out a number of gender analysis in economic, social, education, health, employment spheres. More than 40 resource materials were developed and used for training in selected sectors and local governments. A pool of national gender trainers was also created.
- Legal frameworks: The decision of the government No 59 of 2016 requires a mandatory gender assessment of all draft laws prior to submission to the parliament.

- Statistics: The NSO developed and adopted the scope, definitions and methodologies for gender statistics. Currently, it generates information on 216 indicators clustered into 14 groups and sex disaggregated data produced on 49 indicators is available online.
- Public awareness and education for all on gender: The revised curriculum of primary and secondary education has included content on gender equality and gender based violence. The tertiary education reform addressed gender sensitive policies in universities
- Reducing direct and indirect discrimination against women: proposals for labour law amendment on addressing sexual harassment in workplace, equal wage, maternity leave, labour conditions were elaborated, proposal for new family law were submitted
- Gender responsive budgeting: the first gender analysis of state budget laid a ground to future work on introduction of gender responsive planning and budgeting.

A number of key policy documents relevant to promotion of gender equality have expired in 2015 – 2016.

Gender Equality in political, economic, social and cultural spheres

Assessments and studies by government agencies, bi lateral development agencies (SDC, GIZ, JICA), ADB, WB and research institutions have revealed gender inequalities in various economic and social areas that persist despite of high literacy and education rates of men and women in Mongolia.

Participation in political decision making: Women won seat 17.1% of seats in the Parliamentary Election held in 2016 (13 female MPS out of 76). The new Cabinet has two women ministers out of 14, comprising 14% of the Cabinet. The Minister of Environment and Tourism (MET) that is the Coordinating Ministry of the GDP, and the Minister of Health are women. Four women are appointed to deputy ministerial positions in the Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Ministry of Finance, Ministry of Health, Ministry of Agriculture. There are no women appointed to decision making posts in capital city and 21 aimags in 2016. The gender analysis of the local election held in October 2016 is yet to be obtained. During 2011 local elections, women represented about 16 per cent of all chairpersons of local khurals at bagh, soum and aimag levels⁵.

Gender Gap Report 2015⁶ produced by Harvard University for the World Economic Forum had ranked Mongolia at 56 out of 145 countries, with low Political Empowerment score. This trend is likely to continue in coming years as no significant change has occurred during 2016 Parliamentary election. On the positive side, the Health and Survival gender gap remains fully closed. When compared to 2006, the country has demonstrated improvements across all sub-indexes except Educational Attainment where it has regressed and occupied 73 ranking with 0,992 score. The Economic Participation and Opportunity for women scored 0.783 in 2015⁷:

Table 2. Economic participation and opportunity for women

Criteria for Economic participation and opportunity	female	male	female to male ratio	Global Ranking
Labour force participation	60	72	0,83	60
Wage equality for similar work (survey)	0.75			22
Estimated earned income (PPP US\$)	9,998	14,169	0,71	41

⁵Gender Overview - Mongolia. A Desk Study. SDC, IRIM, p28

⁶<http://reports.weforum.org/global-gender-gap-report-2015/economies/#economy=MNG>, accessed 01 Sep 2016

⁷ ibid

Legislators, senior official, managers	42	58	0,72	15
Professional and technical workers	62	38	1,64	1

Furthermore, the Gender Gap Report of 2015 indicates that the percentage of firms with women top managers (% of firms) was 36% and the percentage of firms with female participation in ownership was 38%. The report also states that women's secure access to land use, control and ownership was 0.5 (1 worst score, 0 best score). However, no data on women and men in relation to land tenure is available from official sources. National Statistical Office is preparing to release findings of the first pilot survey on women's ownership of assets and property. Sex disaggregated data and gender analysis of ownership of land, immobile property would provide valuable evidence for future policy making. According to the survey by SDC on gender relationships in herder communities, traditional norms of property ownership and control over major assets remain strong in rural areas. The study revealed that 58.5 per cent of household property was registered in the name of husband, in 10,7 % cases property titles carried names of both husband and wife and in 8,5 % cases - in wives' name. Key assets - livestock, summer and winter animal camps, vehicles and motorcycles were registered in husband's name in accordance with cultural norm of men who are regarded as heads households, thus entitled to own and control property. On the other hand, rural women's lack of knowledge of equal legal rights on ownership of assets plays a role in continuing disparity.

Similarly, there is no information available on the percentage of women and men in relation to credit. According to the Mongolian Banker's Association, banks do not produce sex-disaggregated information about loans. The availability of outreach programmes to women that target provision of business development and financial services through government initiatives, private lenders and others in general, particularly in relation to the sectors relevant to the Green Development Policy are not collected.

Employment and labourforce participation

According to NSO data, the employment rates were 51,7 for women and 62,6 % for men in 2015. Among unemployed, there were 8.2% men who were actively seeking employment as compared to 6,5 % women. However, World bank data showed higher employment rates for Mongolian women as high as 70% in 2007. With regards to labour force participation, there are slight differences between men (52,6%) and women (47,3%). These differences may be explained by number of women who are out of paid employment due to their child bearing and child rearing activities.

Labour force survey conducted in 2014 by the NSO revealed some gendered patterns and trends. These data affirm the conclusions made by World Bank, ADB studies that women prefer to work in secure paid employment in formal sector and they are more engaged in unpaid household work. On the other hand, there are fewer opportunities for them to engage in business of any scale or self-employment.

Table 3. Labour force participation, by type of employment

Type of work	Men	Women
Household production and other unpaid domestic work	1,3%	3,6%
Animal husbandry	26,7%	24,6%
Self-employment	22,9%	17,9%
Paid employment in formal sector	46,9%	52,7%

Employer	2,0%	1,1%
----------	------	------

Source: NSO Labour Force survey, 2014

The NSO⁸ generates sex disaggregated data on total number of employees by 20-21 sectors. The regular data and thematic survey on labour force have consistently showed high level of segmentation by gender in certain sectors. Women significantly outnumber men in education, health care, retail and wholesale, hospitality and food catering sectors, while men are heavily presented in construction, mining, roads and transport, energy sectors. There are slighter differences in the finance and insurance sectors where women outnumber men by 1,2 point. The data on employees in public administration, defense and law enforcement lumps together different sectors with profound segmentation. For example, defense force, police and other law enforcement agencies are dominated by men, while women's share among civil servants in various public offices is also heavy, particularly in the lower ranks of civil service. This historic occupational segmentation is explained by persistent gender stereotypes and the leftover of the past regime when labour law prohibited women for many decades from about 30 professional technical activities (e.g. driving vehicles which carry more than 25 passengers, to work as machinists, to butcher cattle). Although annulled in 2008, these regulations are still influencing women's and men's choices for professional careers and education.

Table 4. Employment by economic sector

Sector	Total		Gender			
	Number	%	Men		Women	
			Number	%	Number	%
Agriculture	310721	28.0	172286	29.5	138435	26.3
Mining	40926	3.7	33540	5.7	7472	1.4
Processing	85497	7.7	44553	7.6	40944	7.8
Electricity, gas and related	15452	1.4	11923	2.0	3529	0.7
Water and sanitation	7138	0.6	3614	0.6	3524	0.7
Construction	81128	7.3	64174	11.0	16954	3.2
Wholesales, retails, cars and motorcycles	170232	15.3	69357	11.9	100875	19.2
Transport, warehouse	69815	6.3	57699	9.9	12116	2.3
Hotel, food catering	36553	3.3	9162	1.6	27391	5.2
Information, Communication	17797	1.6	9599	1.6	8198	1.5
Finance and insurance	22915	2.1	8780	1.5	14135	2.7
Real estate	1082	0.1	493	0.1	589	0.1
Science and technology	12527	1.1	6429	1.1	6098	1.1
Management and support	12009	1.1	7940	1.4	4069	0.8
Public	66142	6.0	39244	6.7	26898	5.1

⁸ NSO 2011, 2015

administration, defense, law enforcement						
Education	89552	8.1	23569	4.0	65983	12.5
Public health, care work	37488	3.4	6543	1.1	30945	5.9
Arts and entertainment	10602	0.9	4794	0.8	5808	1.1
Other services	20105	1.8	9129	1.6	10976	2.1
Domestic help	1406	0.1	858	0.2	548	0.1
International organizations	1611	0.1	771	0.1	840	0.2
TOTAL	1110698	100%	584371	100%	526327	100%

Important green economy sectors are agriculture, environment, food industry, processing and heavy industry, among others. The recent pilot study by the NSO on employment in environmental sector and green jobs in Mongolia⁹ tested new methodology for data collection on green jobs¹⁰. The employment in environmental sector covers those engaged in production of environmental outputs and those engaged in environmentally friendly processes. The survey revealed that women were underrepresented in the environmental sector compared to their share in the overall labour force. They constituted 45% of all employees in the production of environmental outputs and 43.1% in environmental processes. Sixteen percent of women in this sector have university degree as compared to 11.1 % of men with similar education. The largest share of workers in environmental sector were engaged in agriculture sector, while renewable energy and energy efficient goods and services make a tiny share of 2.3 and 1.0 per cent respectively. It is also important to note that wages in environmental jobs were lower than in other sectors. It will be interesting to see gender wage gaps if any in green employment.

There are reports of continued wage gaps between men and women for work of equal value. The 2015 Gender Gap Report reported it being 0.75. NSO data also presents a visible difference among professional groups and crafts workers. However, this gap in pay is not well recognized due to lack of in-depth national research and unclear methodology.

Studies also show that despite of high representation of women among professional groups, they tend to concentrate in lower ranks while more men are in managerial positions. Career growth for women is constrained by their reproductive roles in child bearing and rearing that often causes interruption in career and affects their professional development. Moreover, it is harder for younger women to enter employment due to employers perception that women of reproductive age are less productive at work due to their family responsibilities. Gender discrimination is rampant during recruitment, particularly in private sector. Re-entering into labour force is also hard for women as it becomes more difficult to compete with men on merit. On the other hand, different retirement age for women at 55 and for men at 60 also affects women's promotion at work as they are perceived to have shorter working lives and thus, not being able to contribute as men can do. Combination of pro-natal policy, lack of sexual and reproductive health education and retirement age difference creates a disabling situation for women to participate in labour force on equal basis with men. Unfortunately, these patterns of gender discrimination are often neglected by policy and decision makers.

Unpaid work

As mentioned above, highly gendered social and cultural norms and values, attitudes and beliefs about gender roles continue to shape the division of labour in Mongolian society. Gender stereotypes bring about more disparities

⁹Employment in the Environmental Sector and Green Jobs in Mongolia, Pilot Study, NSO, PAGE, ILO, 2015

¹⁰ Ibid, page 15. The above pilot study defined that environmental sector includes all economic units that carry out environmental activities with the primary purpose of reducing or eliminating pressures on the environment and to make more efficient use of natural resources.

and unequal share of unpaid domestic and care work that are still largely carried out by women. World Bank study shows that 31,1 percent of employed women were also engaged in unpaid family work. The time use survey by the NSO in 2011 revealed that women spend on average 232 minutes per day or 16.1 % of time on unpaid family work while men's share is 111 minutes or 7.7%. Most of this time goes to household work, care after children, elderly and sick. The SDC study on rural time use confirms that the average daily women herders' workload was 11.1 hours while men's was 9.2 hours. Rural women's workload was higher all year round except of March and December.

At times of economic slowdown the share of domestic unpaid work increases as households tend to take more work themselves instead of purchasing goods and services. This type of increased burden is usually shouldered by women of all ages and men undertaking work outside.

Education and Health

There are no major gender differences in literacy levels and net enrolment rates at primary level. At secondary and tertiary levels of education the gap is reverse or pro-female. According to NSO 2016 and statistical yearbook of 2015 there was gender parity in enrolment in kindergartens (49.3 % of girls) and in general primary and secondary school (50,3% of girls). Female students comprised 40.5% among all students in vocational and technical schools and 57,6% in universities and colleges.

There are significant gender gaps in health between women and men in Mongolia. The life expectancy at birth for men is currently 64.9 years while women's is 74.9 years. Women outlive men by 10 years. The main causes of male mortality at younger ages are non communicable diseases, in particular cardiovascular diseases (33%) and cancer (19.4%). Quarter of all male deaths (25%) are caused by external factors such as road and traffic accidents or injuries. 2016 Study by the National Gerontology Centre and Public Health Institute concluded that unhealthy work and lifestyle, high consumption of alcohol and tobacco, poor diet, lack of physical exercise were major contributing factors to low life expectancy of men in Mongolia. On the other hand, social and cultural norms on gendered behavior seem to play a role in men's attitudes on health that often prevent them from seeking health care service.

Sexual and reproductive health and rights are fundamental for personal development, particularly for women, as accessibility and availability of reproductive and sexual health care services, education and information can play a crucial role in girl's and women's entire future, their education, employment, income earnings, career, marriage and family life. According to UNFPA reports¹¹, Maternal Mortality Rate fell to 25.6 maternal deaths per 100.000 live births in 2015, with significant urban - rural differences. The situational analysis by Monfemnet¹² revealed worsened access to sexual and reproductive health services. The issues of concern is high fertility rates among adolescents, particularly in rural areas. The trend for rising fertility rate in recent years has been explained by pro-natal state policies and support programmes for maternity, children and families with children. In 2013 fertility rate reached 3.1 with higher rates in rural areas (3.6). Alarmingly high is rate of adolescent fertility in rural areas. Unmet needs for family planning has also declined in 2013 as compared to previous studies on 2008 and 2005, for example, the use of contraceptive has fallen to 54%. Overall, limited access to sexual and reproductive health services disproportionately affects women and girls, thus contributing to pattern of gender inequality in Mongolia.

Unequal decision making in families and communities

Studies on gender relations in Mongolia highlight unequal decision making power in families, widespread domestic violence, economic dependence of women and unequal share of household responsibilities. SDC's research on gender relations in herder communities revealed that in rural setting men play dominant roles in decision making roles over family finance and money at all ages. This trend increases with the size of livestock. Lack of voice for women in herder families affects their participation in community affairs. The survey conducted by the SDC revealed

¹¹UNFPA Annual Report 2015

¹²Situational analysis on Sexual and Reproductive Health, 2015.Monfemnet.

that men's participation in community activities was significantly higher. Both men and women participated in bagh and cooperative meetings once per year, however men tend to attend more meetings per year. Women tend not to attend pasture user's group meetings as they perceived not having knowledge of pasture as they are more involved in other tasks of pastoral animal husbandry. Barriers for women's low participation in community activities attributed to traditional perceptions of men's decision making role in families and to women's lack of mobility, their responsibilities of caring for children and elders, long distances, lack of driving skills.

Gender Based Violence

Gender based violence against women and girls is widespread in Mongolia. It is explained by unequal power relations deeply rooted in patriarchal social norms, held by individuals and institutions. According to the NCAV data, one in every three women in Mongolia experienced domestic violence. Domestic and sexual violence are seriously underreported and prosecuted. During 2010 -2015, police reported 88 women killed by their intimate partners and 4,070 injured. During last three years NCAV provided counselling to 1,739 women victims of rape, while only 40 cases were recorded by police. The CEDAW Concluding Observation (2016) expressed concerns about high prevalence of domestic and sexual violence and the lack of statistical information on VAW. It called for improving women's access to justice, pointing out the need to address violence against women with disabilities, rural, older women, girls. The 2014 Report by The Advocates for Human Rights / NCAV concluded that the LCDV (2004) did not provide adequate protection from violence due to lack of harmonised legislation, poor coordination and scarce resources. Lack of knowledge about laws on VAWG among law enforcers, social, medical workers, local government were cited as reasons behind low reporting. Often government service providers promote preservation of family over protection of victims. Aside of legal barriers for women in accessing justice, pervasive lack of knowledge about laws and available remedies among women prevent them from seeking protection.

Sexual harassment in workplace, educational institutions and public spaces

An online perceptions survey conducted by MONES¹³ in 2016 among 753 respondents demonstrated increased awareness of sexual harassment in workplace in Mongolian society as compared with previous surveys. Participants of the survey were mainly women (87 %) and men (13%) with tertiary education. 79,6 per cent thought that this form of gender based violence is widespread. 97 per cent of all women respondents indicated that they had experience of being treated as sex object in workplace or educational institution. Few men (2%) reported being victimised by female supervisors. The most common consequences of sexual harassment cited by respondents were threats and intimidation from managers and supervisors in case of refusal to respond to their demands for sex. Particularly common were cases when a female employee wanted promotion at work or salary raise when bosses obstructed her promotion, increased her workload, dismissed in retaliation. The promotion of female workers is commonly linked with their sexual relationship with male boss. The sexual harassment is widespread in universities and other educational institutions where teachers and professors demand sex in exchange for good marks / scores. There are reports of sexual harassment by public authority figures in rural administration. In worst cases, sexual harassment resulted in rape, pregnancy or divorce of victim. It had profound impact on women's employment and education. It is not only damage to the reputation and associated shame on women victims reported in 21.2% and 14,6 % respectively. Many lost their work productivity, or change their jobs, lost incomes, some reported having to leave schooling, and serious damage to relationships with partner and divorce. The assessment did not examine the patterns of sexual harassment by sectors, however, it is possible to conclude that in male dominated sectors the rate might be higher than average. This may be an additional factor for women's reluctance to work in non-traditional sectors of road and transport, construction, energy or mining.

Type of impact and harm from sexual harassment¹⁴

¹³Survey on sexual harassment in workplace, Mongolian Women's Fund, 2016

¹⁴ Ibid

Impact of sexual harassment on victims	Percentage	Number of responses
Damage to reputation	21,2%	80
Shame among colleagues	14,6%	55
Missed classes	3,7%	14
Left school	4,8%	18
Loss of work productivity, inability for work as usual	20,4%	77
Reduction on wage	2,9%	11
Loss of employment and income	8,8%	33
Change of job	20,7%	78
Got sexually transmitted disease	1,9%	7
Got pregnant	3,2%	12
Expenses for medical treatment	5,6%	21
Negative impact on relationship with partner, domestic violence	6,9%	26
Divorce	5,6%	21
Thought of suicide	2,7%	10
Thought of killing others	1,6%	6
No consequence	23,6%	89
Other types	23,1%	87
Total responses		645

Conclusion on key gender inequalities

Mongolia has achieved gender parity in education at all levels. Moreover, reverse gender gap requires specific policy measures to correct negative trends in improving boy's and men's education. Yet there is strong gender segregation in vocational and technical professional education and training that also need improvement. The existing gender gap in life expectancy at birth requires comprehensive and urgent policy measures towards improving road and traffic safety, occupational safety and improving men's health from changing their attitudes to health and harmful habits.

There are gendered patterns of inequality in Mongolia revealed in available studies by the government, donor agencies and NGOs. These include:

- Widespread gender based violence in various forms in private and public sphere
- Unequal ownership by women on land, housing and productive assets
- Unequal share of household responsibilities, prevalence of women in unpaid activities in care economic, household and family subsistence
- Gender segregation of occupations, prevalence of women in lower paid job segment
- Participation in informal sector has gender disparities that need indepth analysis
- Wage gaps, income gaps
- Disparities in business opportunities for women can be seen in lower women's ownership of enterprises and dominance of men in large scale business
- Lack of sexual and reproductive health services and education affects women of ages and limits their opportunities in education, income generation in formal or informal economy, career prospects.

- Lower participation in political decision making and in public and private sector
- Lower participation in decision making processes in households and in communities (such as pasture user groups)

Rapid assessment of sectors

Institutional structure in support of gender equality in the government

Meetings with gender officers of 12 Ministries and NSO were held to assess the extent to which gender is mainstreamed in sectors. A standard questionnaire was used for all ministries, with some variations to accommodate sector specific questions (see Annex).

The National Council on Gender fulfills the function of the national women's machinery and is responsible for coordination of implementation of the national strategy on implementation of the Law on Promotion of Gender Equality. There are sectoral sub-councils in 13 ministries, 25 subcouncils at aimag and city levels, 9 at district level¹⁵. There are no dedicated gender specialists in Ministries, instead, staff of ministries in various positions / department are usually assigned responsibilities for gender mainstreaming in addition to their main job duty. Gender officers were placed in departments of state administration and human resource, information and press relations or in the internal monitoring. It should be noted that gender officers are not professionals in this field, but trained by the NCG. Only Ministries of Health and Education have assigned specialists in the departments of policy planning to be responsible for gender equality issues. The Secretariat of the NCG is placed in the Ministry of Labour and Social Protection and has 4 full time staff members as of September 2016. Head of the Secretariat directly reports to the Minister.

Three ministries have adopted long term sectoral gender strategies. The Ministry of Environment and Tourism is the Ministry that pioneered a sectoral strategy and has started its implementation since 2014, however, due to staff turn-over it was not possible to assess progress made in 2015-2016. The Ministry of Finance is at the beginning of implementing their strategy and the Ministry of Justice and Internal Affairs have just developed tools for gender mainstreaming in legal instruments that are now ready for testing. The Ministry of Agriculture, Food and Light Industry; Construction and Urban Development were preparing for implementation of upcoming ADB technical assistance project on gender mainstreaming in 4 sectors. These activities represent some initial developments for strengthening institutional mechanism and processes for adequate mainstreaming of gender equality in Mongolia.

Responses to the rapid assessment questionnaire: None of the Ministries were able to respond to question on sectoral policies that support or cause gender inequalities, with exception of the Ministry of Health and Ministry of Justice. There were no studies undertaken on a common division of labour in sectors, not deeper studies on pay differential between men and women working in the sector. There was a general feeling among gender officers and NGOs that there is no wage gap for work of similar value. Although NSO does reporting on pay gaps, the methodology requires further development by research or academic institution. Sex disaggregated data on ownership or management of small, medium scale enterprises was not available. Only three gender focal points were able to identify barriers and challenges that reinforce gender inequalities and how these can affect participation of different groups' ability to participate in sectoral initiatives or projects within GrDP. Newly appointed gender officers in several Ministries were not able to name sectoral initiatives, interventions in the sector that address gender issues. Most of officers were focused in their work on supporting human resource development of the sector, thus, they lacked understanding of policy level interventions with respect to how and what change innovations or

¹⁵Eighth and Ninth Periodic Reports on CEDAW implementation, 2014. CEDAW/C/MNG/8-9. At the time of consultancy a renewal of the sectoral and branch councils was underway.

changes in technology in the sector could bring to gender relations, whether workload of men or women would increase or decrease, whether women or men would lose their incomes, or any other related impact. As most of gender officers were involved in staff development they lacked understanding of substantive gender equality norms as compared to formal equality and . Also, they were not familiar with the Green Development Policy and the NAP, so there was no awareness of how and what their respective sectors could bring to the education, training and professional development of women and men working in the sector or women and men consumers of sectoral products. Sector specific questions on promotion of non traditional roles of women related to the scope of GrDP were not answered as well. The Secretariat of the NCG was not aware of the GrDP and NAP nor was involved in the planning process.

Gaps and Constraints

Individual level: There are uneven capacities to mainstream gender equality in sectoral policy planning at level of individual's understanding of gender equality, knowledge and skills. On the other hand, structural constraints or institutional positioning of gender focal points were responsible for weak gender mainstreaming. The following factors were identified:

- Limited knowledge and understanding of gender issues by an assigned staff member. They may lack experience, theoretical and practical skills in applying concepts, approaches and methods of gender analysis and mainstreaming it in the sectoral policies and plans. Training of gender officers by the NCG Secretariat has been critical in building technical knowledge of sectoral staff.
- Staff turn-over often affects the implementation of Ministry's annual workplan on gender and of gender strategy where they exist.
- Work on gender equality is often considered a burden as it increases a workload. Several officers complained about inadequate compensation for additional work as the regulations on salaries of civil servants do not provide incentive for staff to take on additional tasks for implementing gender equality workplan of Ministries.
- Institutional arrangements with regards of positioning of gender officers in department of state administration and human resources plays a significant role in how gender issues and concerns are viewed in the sector. In some instances, gender officers expressed the need for placing gender officer in departments of policy planning in order to address gender related inequalities at policy level instead of Ministries' human resource issue.
- Restructuring of line ministries during transition in the aftermath of national election has posed new challenges for gender mainstreaming work in some sectors. As some ministries were re-shuffled into new sectors, there is need to re-align sectoral plans, including those on gender. Renewal of subcouncils was underway.

Organizational level: It appears that understanding of gender inequality in sectors among general staff of Ministries and implementing agencies remains low. Most sectors have not conducted any gender analysis or gender auditing, except of initial studies undertaken by environmental and finance sectors in 2014-2015 during preparation of sector's strategies. As these two sectors are at initial stage of implementing their gender strategies no visible results could be reported so far.

Leadership on mainstreaming gender equality is critical. Lack of adequate or correct understanding of gender equality by sectoral decision makers has continued playing a critical role in low or inconsistent attention to gender issues. Evidence suggests that existence of female decision makers in top sectoral positions was important for increasing visibility of gender equality and higher political will in addressing them. For example, forums for recognition of women herders and women in construction sector were held in Agriculture and Construction sectors that helped to highlight some issues, provided an opportunity to bring women 'voices to policy makers and set an example for engaging stakeholders in sectoral policy making.

Lack of accountability for delivery of results on gender equality at all levels, from decision makers to technical staff who draft sectoral policies, rules and regulations, is another factor of democratic governance that limits achievement

of results. Also, absence of incentives such as linking promotion of civil servants with their training, skill development or performance on gender issues, also affects gender mainstreaming.

Shortage of financial and human resources has been observed in all sectors. They rely on donor support for undertaking gender analysis or audit. Capacity building of staff on gender in ministries, implementing agencies and sectoral entities was linked to international development projects. Gender technical consortium and NGOs specializing in gender trainings were critical in assisting government. For example, training on gender based violence for energy plant workers in Khovd province carried out with support of GIZ by MONFEMNET trainers. Experts of the consortium participated in the Working Group on development of Green Development Policy and its Action Plan so that helped to fill the gap in gender expertise in policy planning processes.

There is inconsistency in gender mainstreaming across all sectors. Initiatives tend to fade in longer period of time and the tools, checklists or gender analyses are not systematically used. The NCG training course on gender equality for civil servants, either mandatory or voluntary, has not been systematically used. New civil servants are not required to learn about gender.

Limited database and information in all sectors: Ministries tend to maintain sex disaggregated data about human resources in the ministry and implementing agencies, however they do not collect similar data on labour force, management or ownership of sectoral business entities. This has been explained by refusal of entities to provide confidential information about private business issues, for instance, companies operating in mining and heavy industry; agriculture and food industry. This data gap may be filled by 2016 NSO survey on property ownership.

Linked to deficiencies in data, there is weak monitoring and evaluation for gender results. Due to general lack of gender indicators in sectoral policies, programmes and plans, the annual reporting to the Secretariat of NCG focuses on the implementation of gender specific workplans. The Secretariat compiles and assesses progress achieved by all sectors, however, no public information was available. The report on review of the implementation of national strategy for LPGE 2013-2016 made at the forum in May 2016 and the CEDAW periodic report submitted in 2014 reveals capacity gap in systematic evaluation of government policies and programmes through gender perspective.

Conclusions

Gender mainstreaming in sectors are largely considered in the context of women in development rather than gender and development approach. It appears that annual workplans of sectors and sectoral multi-year development plans and strategies do not sufficiently integrate gender issues. It was not possible to fully assess the extent of gender integration in all sectors due to limited response to questionnaire by sectoral gender officers and unavailability of gender focal points in the ministries. However, it is possible to conclude that the capacity for gender mainstreaming is generally low across all sectors, with some sectors showing uneven progress. Lack of leadership on gender mainstreaming combined with lack of gender analysis and expertise in sectors are the main challenges for advancing gender equality in Mongolia.

The existing gender disparities on Mongolia demonstrate that women are at disadvantage in most sectors. Despite of high educational levels and labour force participation, the opportunities for them are limited as compared to men. Traditional division of labour, women's unpaid contribution to care economics continue to be the main obstacle for them to achieve equal participation in economic, social, political and other domains. This resulted in continued disparities in multiple areas.

The GrDP has potential for eliminating the existing gender disparities. Gender statistics on women's ownership of property and productive resources that will be released in 2016 will serve as a basis for programming. Also ADB TA project in gender mainstreaming of four key sectors (Agriculture, Food and Industry; Construction and Urban Development, Labour and Social Protection, Education, Culture, Science and Sports) will greatly contribute to strengthening institutional mechanism and processes for gender equality. More specific recommendations are presented in the following chapters.

CHAPTER 2. METHODS AND TOOLS FOR GENDER ANALYSIS

Gender analysis is the cornerstone of gender mainstreaming. It involves efforts to understand if, how and why issue affects women and men differently and unequally within particular sector and context. Important factors are the existing policy environment, structures and culture in which the policy operates. Availability of resources is another crucial factor. Evidence from evaluation of previous efforts is necessary. Specialised technical expertise in gender issues and sectoral technical expertise are needed which means that gender mainstreaming specialists and sector specialists should analyse together. Gender statistics, operations research from programmes, projects, monitoring and evaluation data would be required.

Framework questions for gender analysis:

1. What are the differentiated perspectives, roles, needs, rights, priorities and interests of women and men as social groups and stakeholders in the particular sector , i.e. agriculture, energy, construction, mining, ecotourism, environmental protection ?
2. The diversity of women's and men's circumstances, social and economic relationships and status
3. Social, political, legal, economic and institutional contexts to identify constraints, opportunities and entry points for reducing gender inequalities
4. The presence and positions of key actors who can influence development policies and the extent of their support or opposition in relation to specific issues
5. Technical capacity and political readiness of central and local institutions to plan for and implement programmes for gender equality
6. The previous and potential impact of programme interventions on women and men, boys and girls in terms of their access to rights, and on the extent of policy implementation

Gender-based Analysis Plus (GBA+)

GBA+ is an analytical tool used to assess the potential impacts of policies, programs, services, and other initiatives on diverse groups of women and men, taking into account gender and other identity factors. The government of Canada strongly believes that all government policies affect people. While gender and diversity issues may be more obvious in some areas (e.g. education and health) and less obvious in others (e.g. natural resources and defence) this does not necessarily mean that gender is not relevant. GBA+ can and has been used across social, economic, public safety and scientific sectors. The "plus" in the name highlights that GBA+ goes beyond gender, and includes the examination of a range of other intersecting identity factors (such as age, education, language, geography, culture and income). It is a simple tool that can be applied to issues of Green Development Policy of Mongolia by asking key questions focused on inclusion and diversity:

- Who is affected by the issue? How are they affected?
- Are certain groups potentially at a disadvantage?
- Who has been consulted in developing your approach?
- If you consider an issue to be "gender neutral," can this be supported with evidence?

"Using GBA+ does not mean an extra burden. Many people and organizations routinely consider gender and diversity intuitively; in other cases it may require more concerted effort. By routinely using GBA+ checklists and tools, asking GBA+ questions will become integrated into the thought process of any government agency drafting and implementing a policy."

Examples:

Mining and exploration sector: An issue of new job creation in the sector in the next 10 years. The GBA+ questions are the following:

- What are the current socio-demographic characteristics of the mining and exploration sector workforce? Are there any segments of the population that are under-represented (e.g. women, ethnic minority or indigenous people, youth)?
- What are the barriers to participation for under-represented groups (e.g. shift-work, remote location, employer stereotypes)? Can measures be developed to address any perceived or identified barriers?
- In developing sectoral approach to the issue, have you consulted a wide-range of stakeholders, including under-represented groups?

Forestry Sector: The goal of the initiative is to ensure the prosperity of forest-dependent communities by making them more economically competitive and environmentally sustainable, through funding for innovation and economic diversification. The lines of inquiry must challenge the assumptions about the forest sector and the people and communities that depend on it.

- Do forest-dependent communities use forest land resources in the same way? Would they benefit equally from the new program?
- Are the forest sector workers a homogeneous group, are they the same as workers in other sectors like livestock herding or farming or industry?
- Whether the initiative will have an impact on all stakeholders equally? How diverse women and men could experience any unintended consequences from the programme?
- Collect statistical and administrative data and information from stakeholders, taking into consideration diversity of gender and other factors.

It is critical that, throughout the policy development process, we continually ask: "What am I assuming about women, men, boys, and/or girls and about other factors (e.g. geography, culture, age, etc.)?" This will ensure that any potential negative impacts can be addressed.

Gender analysis is a crucial step that has to be followed by policy review and re-adjustment.

Formulation the results for gender equality within policy /programme results frameworks, in line with national priorities is the next step in mainstreaming gender into national policy and its action plan.

Theory of change should consider chain of results from

- Individual consciousness of women and men
- Informal gender norms in culture and social institutions to
- Formal access to resources
- Formal institutions and services

Evidence based results should be derived from sound gender analysis of the sector and context of specific communities, evaluations of previous interventions, lessons learned of what kind of strategies works. Stake-holder analysis and selection of programme coverage are also part of gender mainstreaming into programming. After formulating long term, intermediate outcomes and immediate results from interventions it is important to embed formative research and systematic monitoring of results to track gender results. Practice shows that few gender sensitive and gender relevant indicators should be developed for the monitoring and evaluation of national policies.

Tools for gender analysis:

a) *For institutional and context analysis:*

Mongolian language materials are available from the NCG:

- Handbook on integrating gender equality concepts into policy planning and activities
- Gender Based Analysis Plus developed and used by the Government of Canada, available at <http://www.swc-cfc.gc.ca/gba-acis/index-en.html> ;

- A STEEP tool for Environmental scanning; STEEP is an acronym for: Social, Technological, Economical, Environmental and Political. The STEEP structure is used for scanning developments in the external (contextual) macro environment.
- Gender at Work tool of World Bank

b) For gender mainstreaming with sectoral approach

In macro-economic policy: Economic policy making and poverty reduction through integration of unpaid care work and gender responsive budgeting in the national budget, UNDP.

Checklists for gender mainstreaming in agriculture and natural resource management, water and sanitation, urban development, finance, trade, industry, infrastructure, Gender Toolkit: Public Sector Management, ADB, 2012

In energy and climate change: Guide on Gender Mainstreaming. Energy and Climate Change Projects, UNIDO, 2014

CHAPTER 3. ANALYSIS OF GREEN DEVELOPMENT POLICY THROUGH GENDER EQUALITY PERSPECTIVE

The shift to green development and sustainable way of life requires participation of every person. All men and women need to change their lifestyle, their production and consumption attitudes as well as behaviours in order to shift to environmentally friendly green production and consumption. This shift has to be inclusive and participatory by taking into account gender differentiated roles of men and women in society.

As the end result of green development is achieving wellbeing of all men and women, boys and girls, including future generations. Each and every concept of green development has gender aspect and entails gender responsive strategies.

The human rights based approach entails the integration of human right norms and principles of non-discrimination and equality into policy development as well as the effective participation of marginalized groups in the process, it also ensures accountability of government to the people.

The analysis of the national policy involves examination of the policy from substantive gender equality norm where equality of opportunity should be translated into equality of outcome through enabling laws and regulations, eliminating discriminatory political, social, economic, cultural barriers for women to benefit from green development on equal basis with men. Enabling conditions require changing legal and policy barriers that implicitly perpetuate stereotyped views on gender roles in society.

Green Development Policy and gender equality

Although the Green Development Policy has no direct, explicit references to gender equality, the preamble emphasizes inclusiveness, social justice, improved human well-being. These notions imply participation of men and women of all groups through equitable inclusive processes.

The five guiding principles of the GrDP are formulated in a gender neutral way, however, there are clear gender dimensions in each of principles as they are shaped by social construct of gender and manifested in varying behaviors of men and women at three levels: 1) as workers in green development sectors, 2) as consumers and 3) as decision makers in public and private sector.

Principle of the GrDP	The gender dimensions under the principle
-----------------------	---

GENDER MAINSTREAMING IN GREEN DEVELOPMENT POLICY OF MONGOLIA

Efficient, effective and rationale use of resources	Use of resources by men and women is often different in various domains – at household level, in public office, in manufacturing and production of goods, food processing and production; in using natural resources - water, soil, forests, wild animals and plants; in using vehicles and transport, infrastructure. This is based on traditional gender roles in household and sectors, segregation in professional occupations.
Sectoral policies and planning shall be consistent with green development concept	Women and men are occupied in highly segregated occupations. The relatively balanced ratio of men and women in professional technical positions in sectors allows high involvement of women in planning process that means that women professional staff must have advanced knowledge of green development through training. Women's share in decision making positions in all sectors involved in GrDP implementation remains low. It means that gender differentiated perspectives in planning of sectoral processes may be limited. There is anecdotal evidence from several sectors with women in top decision making positions promoted greater visibility and recognition of gender equality issues in respective sectors. The voices of women in local planning processes are also limited due to low participation rates in community meetings.
Promotion of clean and advanced technologies	This requires gender sensitive ways of promotion of new technologies in order to reach out to women and men consumers of technologies. Women working in science and technology must be supported to develop innovative advanced technologies through incentives and other policy measures.
Ensure citizen's participation in green economic growth	This principle requires men's and women's meaningful participation so that gender sensitive and responsive measures for enabling genuine participation of men and women in communities should be put in place. Study on herder women's participation in soum community meetings revealed their lack of mobility, preoccupation with household and care work that resulted in their lower participation as compared to men.
Engrain environmentally friendly attitude and habits/competence	This principle requires change in attitudes and behaviors of men and women which may vary in some areas while being common in other areas. Targeted policy measures and interventions are required to reach out to all of them at workers, consumers and decision maker's levels across GrDP sectors. The education sector from early childhood to lifelong education is dominated by female teachers, thus their role in sustainable development education is vital.

Similarly to the guiding principles enshrined in the GrDP, the six strategic objectives and policy measures are also formulated in a gender neutral way. An attempt to explore gender dimensions of was undertaken by consulting with gender specialists of Ministries that are involved in the GrDP implementation on the following key questions:

- What are the gender issues and concerns for the sector under the GrDP and policy measure?

- Who is affected by the issue? How are they affected?
- Are certain groups potentially at a disadvantage?
- Who has been consulted in developing your approach?
- If you consider an issue to be “gender neutral,” can this be supported with evidence?

It was clear that sectoral gender specialists were not able to answer these questions due to lack of gender analysis undertaken in the past and the overall lack of institutional capacity for gender mainstreaming in the government. There was no formal involvement of Secretariat of the National Council on Gender in the formulation of the GrDP and the NAP.

Strategic Objectives	Examples of Gender Issues (not exhaustive list)
Strategic Objective #1: Promote resource efficient, low greenhouse emission and wasteless production and services.	Each of sectors has gender related issues in energy, construction, urban development, industry, mining, agriculture, education, health. However, there is no or very limited gender analysis or gender impact assessment undertaken in these sectors. For example, a study on how the promotion low carbon technologies, resource efficient waste-less production and services will affect or benefit men and women herders, vegetable farmers, food producers, construction workers, renewable energy technicians, mining sector workers, artisanal miners and other workers in the GrDPsectors.
Strategic objective #2: Preserve ecosystem balance through intensification of environmental protection and restoration activities and reducing environmental pollution and degradation.	Similarly to the above. Planned policy measures and intervention should be analysed through gender lens to ensure it does not negatively affect the disadvantaged groups in particular aimags / regions. The legal frameworks must ensure their inclusion in ecosystem conservation, implementing climate change adaptation models, developing ecotourism, community based natural resource management, reforestation efforts, in creating inclusive and viable mechanisms for financing. Women’s lack of access to and control over resources should be addressed.
Strategic objective #3: Introduction of financing, tax, lending and other optimal incentives for supporting green economy and increasing investments to promote environmental protection, human development and clean technologies.	Women’s lack of access to and control over resources should be addressed. For example, women’s enterprises may not equally benefit from incentives due to lack of access to financial services. Taxes, lending and investment are gender neutral but evidence from other countries suggests that they have gendered barriers that may put unintended restrictions to women and may not be effective to address pre-existing gender gaps. Regulatory frameworks should be developed using gender analysis and gender responsive budgeting tools.
Strategic objective #4: Promotion of green employment, poverty reduction and engraining/promoting green life style.	The NAP has clearly identified of women, older, youth as targeted groups for green jobs and social protection. The lack of child care facilities was identified to gender problem that affects women’s employment in green jobs has been addressed by GDP NAPis that affects women’s labor force participation. Additionally, there are inter-related gender issues of wage gap, prevalence of women in unpaid productive work, unequal share of household responsibilities between men and women, lack of sexual and reproductive health care and rights, lack of family planning, lack of anti-sexual harassment policies in workplace. High job segmentation and concentration of women in lower paid occupations in formal sector and

	informal sector should be addressed as well as gendered division of labour with a view of eliminating existing inequalities by 2030. Issue of payments for eco-services to be examined through gender lens to ensure that women herders to benefit from it on equal basis with men.
Strategic objective #5: Promotion of “Live in harmony with nature” living and culture values and make education, science and innovation as catalysts for green development.	Women’s potential contribution to be fully utilized. As women play significant roles in education sector, they could be targeted as educators of sustainable lifestyle. Also, in science and technology gender barriers should be removed to engage both women and men in developing clean technology innovations, provide incentives and investment that encourage greater women’s participation. This relates not only to industries where women’s dominate in labour force such as food processing, but also in non-traditional sectors of renewable energy, transport, construction.
Strategic objective #6: Develop and implement population settlement plan in accordance with climate change, availability of natural and other resources in regions and restoration	Gender dimensions of climate change mitigation and adaptation, greening safe cities and public spaces, housing, transportation would include inclusion of women’s different opinions and ideas. On the other hand, their views would help to create a new social practice / culture of urban planning that provide safety and comfortable living for all groups (children, older, people with disabilities, taking into account gender dimensions of each group).

The NAP for GDP could be further improved by elaborating on how currently disadvantaged groups would benefit from planned interventions. It will be important that planned new enabling legal frameworks for many subject areas under all six strategic objectives take into account persisting gender inequalities. Addressing structural and institutional barriers to gender equality is the stepping stone that should be accompanied by targeted interventions for inclusion of women and girls of disadvantaged groups into mainstream sustainable development processes.

Conclusions and recommendations:

1. The design of the GrDP and NAP made implicit commitment to contributing to gender equality in its objectives, specific policy measures and actions. During review process, clear outputs and indicators on gender equality should be developed to make more explicit commitments.
2. The GrDP and NAP do not challenge the existing gendered divisions of labour, tasks, responsibilities and opportunities. A long term Action Plan for the implementation of GrDP till 2030 should envision appropriate policy measures towards changing status quo.
3. GrDP lacks a comprehensive, holistic approach to gender equality due to limited gender analysis undertaken in sectors. It could build on sectoral developments on integrating gender equality. As the MET, MinFin, MJIA have adopted own long term gender strategies, a gender strategy for the entire GrDP could be adopted (see Chapter 5 with a proposed multisectoral strategy for integration of gender equality in the GrDP).
4. GrDP’s gender strategy should synergise with the ADB technical assistance programme for gender mainstreaming in four sectors: Agriculture, Food and Light Industry; Construction and Urban Development; Education, Science, Culture and Sports; Labour and Social Protection that would be implemented in 2017-2018.
5. There is lack of capacity for gender analysis within sectors. On the other hand, the National Council on Gender and its Secretariat is under-staffed and under resourced to provide consistent coordination on gender issues. Institutional coordination mechanism should be strengthened. Possible way for GrDP is to bring in gender

experts into working groups, forge collaboration between national gender experts and sectoral experts and obtain funding from donor agencies.

Recommendation to PAGE / UNDP

In the remaining period of the PAGE in 2016- 2017, PAGE can start integrating gender in the planned activities (see workplan for PAGE) :

- Ensure integration of gender concerns into local development plans of Sukhbaataraimag and Ulaanbaatar City, through participatory and inclusive planning processes, include gender experts in the development process.
- Study on shifting tax and subsidies should incorporate gender issues and provide recommendations
- High Level briefing for the Government should include gender concerns identified by the gender equality analysis
- High Level briefing for the Government should include gender concerns identified by the gender equality experts
- T 21 model to include existing gender disparities in opportunities and outcomes of development
- Policy briefs for parliamentarians incorporate or highlight gender equality concerns
- Gender balance among participants of training for green entrepreneurship and among the pool of trainers in related sectors
- Ensure equal participation of men and women in the development of standards and norms on waste managements and capacity building activities
- Ensure that gender equality advocates participate in the Working Group on green credit fund and are consulted with on the issues of green credit fund, provided inputs and proposals that address challenges and obstacle for women entrepreneurs in accessing green credit fund
- Raise gender and related issues for accessibility of green credit fund to law makers
- The renewed Technical Committee to have member with gender expertise
- Proposal for an independent national coordination mechanism to include civil society participants working on gender equality, poverty eradication, corruption and other related issues of inclusive development
- All training activities to be gender sensitive and avoid gender stereotyping
- At the high level event and partnership event to highlight how PAGE and GDP is addressing concerns of vulnerable groups (gender, the extreme poor)
- In preparing a project document for the next phase of PAGE include gender analysis of priority sectors, ie. green jobs

CHAPTER 4: PROPOSED GENDER MAINSTREAMING STRATEGY FOR GREEN DEVELOPMENT POLICY

SWOT Analysis for gender mainstreaming of GDP and NAP*Strengths:*

- Commitment of the GoM to gender equality
- Commitments to inclusiveness and social justice affirmed in the GDP 2030
- Firm planned interventions for creating jobs, education and social protection for women that were identified as priority areas under Strategic Objective Four

Weaknesses

- Uneven commitment to gender mainstreaming in sectors and weak capacity for gender mainstreaming in economic sectors at sectoral level and local governments
- Weak cross-sectoral coordination of gender mainstreaming
- Lack of participation of women's civil society groups in policy planning, implementation and monitoring

Opportunities

- Adoption of the Gender strategy of the MET for 2015-2030 and MinFin for 2016-2030
- Existence of the national Gender Consortium for research and gender analysis and of the pool of national gender trainers
- NSO gender statistics unit with developed and tested methodologies for collection of data
- ADB technical assistance project on gender mainstreaming in national and local plans in four sectors - Agriculture, Food and Light Industry; Construction and Urban Development, Education, Science, Culture and Sports; Labour and Social Protection sectors to be implemented in 2017-2018
- Openness of donors to support efforts of the MoG to advancing gender equality (ongoing projects and programmes funded by SDC, GIZ, Global Affairs Canada in mining, energy sectors)

Threats:

Economic crisis, austerity measures and lack of investment into green economy may distract priorities from gender mainstreaming in the GDP, lack of funding may become a threat

Proposed Gender Mainstreaming Strategy for the GDP

Objective of the Strategy: To contribute to the achievement of gender equality in Mongolia in key sectors by 2030 through green development, thus, to contribute to the overall sustainability of development results of the GDP

Long term Goal: By 2030, Mongolian women and men enjoy equal rights and equally benefit from green development

Outcome 1: BY 2030, Gender responsive public policies in green economy sectors are developed and implemented

Output 1.1: Enhanced capacity within GDP sectors to undertake gender analysis and develop gender sensitive laws, policies, regulations

Output 1.2: Enhanced capacity of GDP sectors to develop gender responsive budgets and plans

Outcome 2: By 2020, established effective partnerships for gender mainstreaming at local and national levels

Output 2.1: By 2020, cross sectoral gender mainstreaming working groups established and exchange knowledge and good practices on gender mainstreaming in green economy

Output 2.2: Strengthened national mechanism for gender equality

Outcome 3: Expanded participation of women and men in the green development processes at local and national levels

Outputs 3.1: Improved multi-stakeholder participation in planning, implementation and monitoring of green development policy at local and national levels

Proposed Action Plan for mainstreaming gender equality in the implementation of GDP and its NAP

Key actions	Target 2016-2020	Target 2020-2025	Target 2020-2030	Implementing agency and Partnerships
Outcome 1: Gender responsive public policies in green economy sectors developed and implemented				
Output 1.1. Strengthened capacities within GDP sectors to undertake gender analyses and develop gender sensitive laws, policies, regulations	50 % of sectors undertake sector gender analyses	All sectors undertake gender analyses	All sectors review and regularly update gender analyses	Ministries, UNDP and bilateral partners, NCG
Key Activities for Output 1.1: capacity building for gender analysis in green development for policy planning departments of line ministries and in local administration units ; support drafting of gender responsive legal frameworks, taxes, incentives, regulations	Review existing legal frameworks through gender lens. Develop proposals for gender responsive legal frameworks for 50% of sectors	Implement and monitor new legal instruments and policies through gender lens	Monitor and amend policies as necessary to better address gender gaps	
Output 1.2 Build capacities of GDP sectors to develop gender	50 % of sectors and local governments	All sectors and local governments undertake GRB	All sectors and local governments undertake GRB	Sectors and aimag and city

GENDER MAINSTREAMING IN GREEN DEVELOPMENT POLICY OF MONGOLIA

responsive budgets and plans	undertake sector GRB			governments, NCG
Activities for Output 1.2.				
Outcome 2: Effective partnerships for gender mainstreaming at local and national levels				
Output 2.1: Cross sectoral exchange of knowledge and good practices on gender mainstreaming in green economy	Target: Technical working groups, National Coordinating Body for Sustainable Development organize annual forums on priority issues	Target:	Target:	Ministries, PAGE / UNDP, research and partners, NCG
Key Activities for Output 2.1. develop sectoral knowledge products, document good practices, disseminate through discussions, exchange and multimedia				
Output 2.2: Strong national mechanism for gender equality effectively engaged in green economy sectors	Target: A core working group with technical expertise on gender equality in green economy established and is functioning	Target:	Target:	
Key Activities for Output 2.2. promote collaboration among technical experts in sectors and gender experts, support multisectoral joint initiatives and projects	Joint analytical reports by the national coordination body and experts teams on priority gender issues			
Outcome 3: Expanded participation of women and men in the green development processes at local and national levels				
Outputs 3.1: Improved multi-stakeholder participation in planning, implementation and	Target: 50% of aimags organize multi-stakeholder participatory	Target: 100%	Target: 100%	Local Governments and national

monitoring of green development policy at local and national levels	planning and monitoring processes			Coordinating body for SDG
Key Activities: Regular consultations, public forums and dialogues held on priority green development issues at local and national levels; Build capacity of women's groups and other local CSOs on priority issues in selected aimags	Carry out multistakeholder forums in 10 aimags	Scale up to all aimags	Regular multistakeholder participation across the country	

Tools for gender mainstreaming in sectors

1. Around 40 tools developed by the National Council on Gender that were tested in the Mongolian context. [available in Mongolian language and can be obtained from the NCG]
2. Also See Chapter 4 for Tools for Gender Analysis for sectors that could be applied for integration of gender equality in the GDP
3. Tools for Gender Responsive Budgeting
4. Tools for Gender Audit (ILO tools, Gender Impact Assessment tool) http://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---dgreports/---gender/documents/publication/wcms_187411.pdf
5. Training Manual on gender mainstreaming in environment and energy projects, UNDP, 2007

http://www.undp.org/content/dam/undp/library/Environment%20and%20Energy/Sustainable%20Energy/Gender_Mainstreaming_Training_Manual_2007.pdf

6. Gender Mainstreaming in Practice. A Handbook. UNDP, 2005

http://www1.uneca.org/Portals/ngm/Documents/Gender%20Mainstreaming/Gender_Mainstreaming_in_PracticeRBC.pdf

CHAPTER 5. GENDER INFORMATION REQUIRED FOR POLICY PLANNING

This chapter provides recommendations for gender specific data that is required for policy planning and implementation of Sustainable Development Goals and Green Development Policy and its NAP.

National Statistical Office generates sex disaggregation data and produces thematic surveys on priority issues. Social and demographic statistics, labour force data, poverty are disaggregated by sex, age, location, educational level, and other relevant determinants. However, it is clear that gender statistics require new kinds of data for the sustainable development agenda. Gender issues and concerns on equality should be part of the original data collection in order to reveal any gender disparity. Sex disaggregation does not equal gender statistics because separating data by males and females does not provide an analysis in itself¹⁶. For example, the pilot survey on green jobs by NSO provides useful insights into women and men engaging in “green” processing jobs. Regrettably, the business opportunities for women and men to engage in green enterprise could not be analysed as there was no question in the survey about gender of a company’s owner. The fact that women are less likely to start own business due to entrenched gender stereotypes and systemic barriers for them was not factored in the original survey design.

The core set of gender indicators for Asia and the Pacific developed by UNESCAP proposed a minimum range of gender statistics that all countries in the Asia Pacific should aspire. The UNESCAP also suggests that rural women to be priority for the countries of the region by proposing a set of indicators to capture progress in poverty alleviation, participation in productive activities that combine both paid and unpaid care work performed by women, education, health and nutrition, governance and participation in public life and decision making at local levels, and human rights of women and girls with focus on several types of gender based violence. The approach emphasizes collecting data for monitoring all age groups and other important determinants as the existing inequalities in women’s access to and control over natural and economic resources, equal benefitting from development results, business opportunities due to entrenched unequal gender division of labour and share in productive and reproductive work. For the basic domain on environment and climate change, in addition to the macro-indicator on greenhouse gas emissions per capita, it was suggested to include 2 headline indicators relevant to gender: 1. Proportion of women in environmental and climate change decision making bodies at the national level and 2. Proportion of environmental and climate change funds allocated to women and gender issues at the national level. These proposed sets of core and non-core indicators echo the recommendations by UN Women for monitoring gender equality in SDGs¹⁷.

Recommendations for data gathering that should inform policy planning and implementation related to SDG and GDP.

The MAPS for SDGs Gender Baseline analysis against SDGs in Mongolia focused on SDGs 1, 5, 8, 10, 11, 13 and 16 identified 87 relevant indicators for measuring progress on these goals. Mongolia already collects data on 61 indicators, out of which information on 39 indicators are available from the NSO, while data for 23 indicators are collected by government departments and agencies. There is no readily available information on 26 indicators, mostly for measuring targets under the SDG 5, the stand-alone goal on gender equality, and the SDG 16 on peaceful and inclusive societies for sustainable development. Several important gaps in data on gender equality will be filled

¹⁶ Making data count for all. Good practices in integrating gender in national statistical systems, UNESCAP, ECE, ESCWA, 2015.

¹⁷ Monitoring gender equality and the empowerment of women and girls in the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable development, UN Women, 2015

up by the 2016 Survey on property ownership carried out by the NSO and the upcoming survey on gender based violence that will be undertaken in 2017 with support of UNFPA and Swiss Development Agency.

In addition to the MAPS study, gender relevant indicators are added for each of relevant 16 SDGs. All these proposed gender related indicators are highly relevant to planning of sustainable development policies and monitoring implementation. With regards to the GDP and its NAP, indicators may be classified as directly relevant (being instrumental) for planning processes (code 1) and those that provide valuable information and ensure better planning (code 2).

SDG indicator for targets	Recommendation	Relevance for GDP Code
<p>SDG 5</p> <p>5.1. 1. Whether legal frameworks are in place to promote gender equality and non-discrimination against all women and girls</p>	<p>This is qualitative indicator recommended by UNESCAP.</p> <p>Legal review for compliance with CEDAW norms of substantive equality and non-discrimination against women and girls should be carried out. Particular focus on legislation that are relevant to women’s employment in formal and informal sector, access to credit, microfinance, education, professional and vocational training, other services in domains of GDP six strategic objectives. Attention to be paid on how existing laws and practices affect different groups of women, by age, location, education, economic status, health, disability, ethnicity. The legal review should be held in consultation with women’s CSOs.</p>	<p>1</p>
<p>5.2. Four types of data are necessary to monitor domestic violence, sexual violence, human trafficking, perpetrated by intimate partners or others or by any persons:</p> <p>5.2.1. Proportion of ever-partnered women and girls (aged 15-49) subjected to physical and /or sexual violence by a current or former intimate partner, in the last 12 months</p> <p>5.2.2. Proportion of women and girls (aged 15-49) subjected to sexual violence by persons other than an intimate partner, since age 15</p> <p>5.2.3. Proportion of girls and women (aged 15-19 and 20-24) who were subjected to sexual</p>	<p>Follow MAPS recommendation</p> <p>Data can be obtained through Demographic and Health Survey (DHS) or thematic survey on gender based violence against women and girls. This survey is planned in 2017 by NSRO with support of UNFPA and SDC.</p>	<p>2</p>

GENDER MAINSTREAMING IN GREEN DEVELOPMENT POLICY OF MONGOLIA

violence before age of 15 by any persons		
5.2.4. Number of detected and non- detected victims of human trafficking per 100,000, by sex, age and form of exploitation	Administrative data from law enforcement institutions, NGOs such as NCAV, Centre for Gender equality, Centre for Human Rights and Development working on human trafficking, and through field studies	2
5.3. Number of early or under-age marriage, disaggregated by sex, age and location or Percentage of women aged 20-24 who were married or in a union before age of 15 or 18.	To be collected by NSO through DHS, Multiple Indicator cluster survey (MICS) or Census (thematic study on household and families	2
5.4.1. Percentage of time spent on unpaid domestic and care work, by sex, age and location	Time use survey carried out by NSO in 2011. For the next time use survey it is recommended to include individuals aged 5 and above to capture the unpaid work by girls and adolescents.	2
5.4.2. Average weekly time spent on water collection including waiting time at public supply points, by sex, age, location	Household surveys. Relevant to the GDP/ NAP	1
5.4.3. Proportion of preschool children who are in early childhood care and education programmes, by sex and age of the child, location and family income	Household surveys – this data to be used for monitoring of the GDP/ NAP.	1
5.5.1 Proportion of women in executive positions (ministers, local governments), judiciary and law enforcement (judges and police officers), and managers in public and private sector enterprises	The NSO generates information on proportion of women in legislature and in managerial positions. It should be clarified whether the managerial positions are in public or private sector. Additional disaggregation by sectors is needed for monitoring of GDP /NAP in particular in green development sectors. Data on managerial positions held by men and women should be disaggregated by economic / social sector and location, private or public sector	1
5.5. 1. Share of female researchers by seniority level	This information to be obtained from administrative files. It will be important for gender mainstreaming in the GDP /NAP. Field study can be carried out.	1
5.6.1. Percentage of women who make their own sexual and reproductive decisions (age 15-49)	DHS, MICS Should be disaggregated by age, location, income and other determinants (education)	2
5.6.2. Whether national laws and regulations guarantee all women and adolescents access to sexual	This can be carried through field study and obtained from academic or other research institution	2

GENDER MAINSTREAMING IN GREEN DEVELOPMENT POLICY OF MONGOLIA

and reproductive health services, information and education		
5.a.1. Percentage of people with secure rights over agricultural land (out of total agricultural workers), by sex, location	Follow MAPS recommendation. Agricultural statistical survey by MoA should have sex disaggregated data on owners and operators of enterprises in the sector.	1
5.a.2 Share of women among owners or rights bearers of agricultural land, by type of tenure and location, education, ethnic group	Agricultural census, statistical survey. Local authorities can collect disaggregated data on individual owners or business entities operating on agricultural land.	1
5.a.3. Share of women owning productive assets and property	This type of data may be available from the Property Ownership Survey by NSO carried out in 2016.	1
5.a.4 Number of special measures to guarantee women's equal rights to land ownership and control, natural resources, access to financial services	Qualitative indicator on policy, law and regulations that guarantee women's rights (ownership and control) over land and other natural and economic resources / assets, access to financial services.	1
5.b.1. Proportion of individuals who own mobile telephone, by sex and location 5.b.2 Proportion of individuals who use Internet, by sex and location	There is need to collect and analyse data with regards to use of ICT such as use of radio, television, cellular phone, computers, network hardware and software, satellite systems, applications and services relating to use of ICT There is need to disaggregate by sex, age and location.	1
5.c. Expenditure on gender equality policy as a percentage of total government expenditure	Administrative sources by National Council on Gender and Ministry of Finance as there are plans to start implementation of gender responsive budgeting during 2016-2030.	1
SDG 1 End poverty 1.2 Proportion of individuals who have independent source of income, by sex, age, location, disability, employment status	This indicator is suggested in addition to poverty indicators that routinely generated by the NSO (i.e. proportion of population living on less than 1.25 \$ per day and other headline indicators for households). Household surveys, DHS and household budget, or labour force surveys should include this indicator as it is useful to see economic independence of women and men, disaggregated by age, health and disability status, employment status	2
1.3. Indicators for social protection coverage to be disaggregated by sex, age and location	Indicators for social protection system should be disaggregated. GDP / NAP indicator (#93 and 94) on social insurance coverage of herders and farmers must be disaggregated by sex, age and location	1

<p>SDG 2 End hunger and malnutrition and promote sustainable agriculture</p> <p>2.1.1 Prevalence of population with moderate /severe food insecurity, by sex and age</p>	<p>Household survey, to disaggregate by sex, age and location and other variables</p>	<p>2</p>
<p>2.2.1 Prevalence of stunting in children under 5 years of age, by sex, location and income</p>	<p>Household survey</p>	<p>2</p>
<p>2.2.2 Prevalence of anaemia among women of reproductive age</p>	<p>Household survey</p>	<p>2</p>
<p>2.3 Share of women farmers, herders and food producers</p>	<p>Both GDP and SDV would benefit from collecting data on share of women farmers and food producers among small scale holders that could be collected by the Min of Agriculture through Agricultural Census</p>	<p>1</p>
<p>SDG 3 Ensure healthy lives and promote wellbeing for all ages</p>	<p>The indicators for SDG 3 were not reviewed by the MAPS. Many of gender related indicators are routinely generated by the NSO and readily available (i.e. maternal mortality rate, birth attendance by skilled health personnel)</p> <p>Death rates from communicable and non-communicable diseases should be disaggregation by sex, age and location.</p> <p>3.2, 3.3, 3.4, 3.5, 3.8 should be disaggregated by sex</p>	<p>2</p>
<p>3.7. Percentage of women of reproductive age (15-49) who have their need for family planning satisfied with modern methods</p>	<p>DHS, MICS</p>	<p>2</p>
<p>3.7. Adolescent birth rate per 1,000 women in the age groups 10-14 and 15-19</p>	<p>Administrative surveys, census and other surveys</p>	<p>2</p>
<p>3.9. Prevalence of lower respiratory infections by sex and age women and children as it is part of target.</p>	<p>Suggested indicator for 3.9 can be used for monitoring the health impact of indoor air pollution caused by use of coal on women and children</p>	<p>1</p>
<p>SDG 4. Ensure inclusive and equitable education and promote lifelong learning opportunities for all</p> <p>4.3. Enrolment ratio by level and type of education including technical and vocational education, disaggregated by sex</p>	<p>Enrolment ratios for all levels of education are routinely generated by NSO.</p> <p>Data on gender distribution of tertiary graduates by field of study profession is readily available.</p>	<p>1</p>

<p>4.5. Gender Parity Index for targets 4.1.,4.2, 4.3,4.4. and 4.6.</p>	<p>This indicator allows monitoring of equal access to all levels and vocational training for vulnerable, including persons with disabilities, ethnic minority, and children and youth in vulnerable situations.</p>	<p>1</p>
<p>4.7. Percentage of 15 year old students enrolled in secondary school demonstrating at least a fixed level of knowledge across a selection of topics in sustainable development, including environmental science and geoscience , gender equality and human rights</p>	<p>This is newly suggested indicator by UN Women. Data on this indicator could be included in household surveys. Similar indicator (# 95) is proposed by the GrDP / NAP as a non core set indicator</p>	<p>1</p>
<p>SDG 6 Ensure availability and sustainable management of water and sanitation for all 6.1. Average weekly time spent in water collection (including waiting time at public supply points) by sex, age and location</p>	<p>Time use survey</p>	<p>1</p>
<p>Goal 7 Ensure access to affordable modern sources of energy 7.1. Percentage of population with primary reliance on non-solid fuels, by income /wealth, urban / rural location</p>	<p>Household surveys</p>	<p>1</p>
<p>Goal 8 Promote sustained, inclusive and sustainable economic growth, full and productive employment and decent work for all</p>	<p>Indicators proposed for 8.3,8.6, 8.7, 8.8. and 8.10 targets should be disaggregated by sex</p>	<p>1</p>
<p>8.5. Average hourly earnings of female and male employees by occupation 8.5. Employment to working age population ratio (15 and above age) and disability rate</p>	<p>Household and establishment surveys Employment to working age population ratio (above 15) by sex, age and disability status Household surveys</p>	<p>1</p>
<p>Goal 9 Build resilient infrastructure, promote inclusive and sustainable industrialisation and foster innovation</p>		<p>1</p>

9.2. Manufacturing employment as a per cent of total employment, by sex	Household and establishment surveys	1
Goal 10 Reduce inequality within and among countries	Indicators proposed for targets 10.2, 10.3, 10.7 should be disaggregated by sex	2
10.3. Growth rates of household expenditure or income per capita among the bottom 40% of the population and the total population (also disaggregated to look at single mother households within the bottom 40 per cent).	Household surveys to ensure capturing individual level to see women and men's income growth	2
Goal 11 Make cities and human settlements inclusive, safe, resilient and sustainable	Data on 11.5 to be disaggregated by sex	1
11.2 Proportion of the population that has convenient access to public transport	Follow the MAPS recommendation on 11.2 as the definition of convenient access to public transport should be agreed in consultation with women and men users of public transport. In addition, age, location and economic status to be considered in the study. The location of bus routes, stations/ public transit stops can be a proxy indicator but not sufficient.	
11.2.2. Proportion of women and children subjected to physical or sexual violence in last 12 months, by perpetrator, place of occurrence	Survey on Gender based violence that will be carried in 2017 by NSO with support of the UNFPA	1
11.3. Ratio of land owners rate (by population) to population growth rate in Ulaanbaatar city at comparable scale	MAPS recommendation: further improvements in registration of land ownership in Ulaanbaatar city registration. Land ownership data to be disaggregated by their sex.	1
11.5 Number of deaths caused by disasters, including water related disasters, by sex and age	Demographic statistics, administrative data or field study	1
11.7. Proportion of women and children subjected to physical or sexual harassment in last 12 months, by perpetrator, place of occurrence	11.7. Follow the MAPS recommendation for improved cooperation between General Department of Police and the National Centre Against Violence (NCAV), however, the NCAV is an NGO that produces data on voluntary basis. Instead, the NRSO led DHS and GBV survey should be emphasized	2
Goal 12 Ensure sustainable consumption and production patterns	GDP indicators on sustainable consumption and production can be used to address gender dimensions. For example, percentage or share of bank loans to finance green projects disaggregated by sex of owner of the enterprise	1

Goal 13 Climate action	Percentage / share of women and men's access to technologies on climate change mitigation and adaptation	1
Goal 15 Protect, restore, promote terrestrial ecosystems Proportion of women in environmental and climate change decision making bodies at the national level	This indicator is recommended for measuring the GDP's progress on gender equality in general. It is included in the core set of indicators for Asia and the Pacific region by UNESCAP	1
15.9. Proportion of environmental and climate change funds allocated to women and gender issues at the national level	This indicator is recommended for measuring the GDP's progress on gender equality in general. It is included in the core set of indicators for Asia and the Pacific region by UNESCAP	1
Share of women in labour force in ecosystem protection, conservation by sectors (forestry, biodiversity, land restoration and other related sectors).	GDP indicators on employment (#84 Labour force participation, 85 unemployment rate)	1
Share of women who received vocational training in ecosystem protection, conservation	GDP indicator on technical vocational training (88) must be disaggregated by sex and sector /or field of training	
Goal 16 Promote peaceful inclusive societies for sustainable development 16.1. Number of victims of intentional homicide by characteristics of victims, perpetrators per 100,000 population, by sex and age	In addition to MAPS recommendation the 16.1 data should be disaggregated by sex and age	2
16.2.1 Percentage of children aged 1-14 who experienced any physical punishment by caregivers in the past month, by sex	Household surveys, focus field studies	
16.2.2. Percentage of young men and women aged 18-24 who have been subjected to sexual violence by age 18	This data will be collected by NSO in 2017 survey on GBV with support of UNFPA	
16.2.3. Number of detected and non-detected victims of human trafficking per 100,000, by sex, age and form of exploitation	MAPS recommendation on human trafficking to be followed up. Data to be disaggregated by sex, age and form of exploitation	

<p>16.3. 1. Percentage of victims of violence in the previous 12 months who reported their victimisation to competent authorities or other officially recognised conflict resolution mechanisms (also called crime reporting rate)</p>	<p>Data on this indicator should be disaggregated by sex, age and type of crime</p>	
<p>16.6.2 Proportion of population satisfied with their last experience with public service</p>	<p>Follow MAPS recommendation. In addition, the Cabinet Secretariat should ensure that surveys and reports are gender sensitive, thus, ensure inclusion of voices of women and men, particularly from disadvantaged groups.</p>	
<p>16.7. Proportion of decision making positions in public institutions by age, sex, disability and population groups</p>	<p>Follow MAPS recommendation. All indicators proposed for targets 16.7 should be disaggregated by sex, age, disability status</p>	
<p>16.a.1 Percentage of victims who reported physical and / or sexual crime to law enforcement agencies during last 12 months, disaggregated by sex, age, region and population group</p>	<p>Follow the MAPS recommendation, however, the DHS and GBV survey must be carried out by NSO</p>	
<p>16.b.1 Percentage of population reporting having personally felt discrimination against or harassed within last 12 months on the ground of discrimination prohibited under international human rights law, disaggregated by age, sex, region and population group</p>	<p>Follow MAPS recommendation. In addition to MAPS recommendation, a qualitative study on non-discriminatory laws for sustainable development should be undertaken by relevant ministries (Ministry of Justice and sectoral), National Human Rights Commission and NGOs. Civil society participation is a must.</p>	<p>1</p>
<p>Goal 17 Strengthen the means of implementation and revitalise the global partnership for sustainable development</p> <p>17.8 Proportion of individuals using the internet by sex, age and location</p> <p>17.9 Financial and other resources made available to strengthen gender statistics as percentage of total resources to strengthen statistical capacity</p>	<p>Household survey</p> <p>Administrative data of NSO</p>	

With regards to the proposed set of indicators for the GDP and NAP¹⁸, it will be vital for gender mainstreaming to include indicators on equal access and control over productive resources (land, credit, microfinance, other natural and economic resources). This type of indicators will be also useful for monitoring of the several SDGs.

The following indicators proposed for the GDP should be disaggregated by sex and other determinants:

- No 12 Employment in agricultural sector disaggregated by sex, subsector, location
- No 79 – Percentage of women owned companies accessing green loans and funding for green projects
Microfinance could be also included.
- No 84 – Labour force participation, disaggregated by sex, age, sector
- No 85 – Unemployment disaggregated by sex, age, educational level
- No 88 – Number of students in vocational technical education, by field, disaggregated by sex and age
- No 93 – Total number of herders covered by social insurance, disaggregated by sex, age and location
- No 94 – Total number of farmers covered by social insurance, disaggregated by sex, age and location

No 95 – Number of students receiving sustainable development education in secondary and tertiary levels of education (age 15 +).

¹⁸ Green Development Policy Indicators, NSO, MEGDT and PAGE, 2015

ANNEX 1. LIST OF LITERATURE

ADB (n.d), Gender Checklist Agriculture, Asian Development Bank (ADB), accessed 10th July, 2016, available at: <https://www.adb.org/sites/default/files/publication/28723/agri2.pdf>.

ADB and WB (2005), Mongolia Country Gender Assessment, Manila, Philippines, 2005, East and Central Asia Regional Department and Regional and Sustainable Development Department, Asian Development Bank (ADB), Environment and Social Development Unit, East and Asia Pacific region, World Bank (WB).

AF (2013), Gender Assessment of Small-scale Mining in Mongolia (Draft), In-Country Mixed-Method Research and Data Collection, October 2013, the Asian Foundation.

CEDAW (2014), Consideration of Reports Submitted by States Parties Under Article 18 of the Convention, Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women, CEDAW/C/MNG/CO/8-9, 2014.

CEDAW (2016), Concluding Observations on the Combined Eighth and Ninth Periodic Reports Of Mongolia, Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women, CEDAW/C/MNG/CO/8-9, 2016.

Bieri Sabin and Sancar Annemarie (2009), Power and Poverty. Reducing gender inequality by ways of rural employment? Gender Pathways Out of Poverty Rural Development, presented at the FAO-IFAD-ILO Workshop on Gaps, Trends and Current Research in Gender Dimensions of Agriculture and Rural Employment: Rome, 31st March – 2nd April 2009.

GGGI (2016), Indicators for Mongolia's National Green Development Policy, Global Green Growth Institute, May 2016.

Government of Canada (n.d), Apply GBA+ (Gender-based Analysis Plus) to your work, accessed on 11/07/2016, available at: www.swc-cfc.gc.ca/gba-accs/apply-appliquez-en.html.

ESCAP (2015). Core Set of Gender Indicators for Asia and the Pacific, Economic Social Council, United Nations Economic and Social Commission for Asia and the Pacific (ESCAP), 23rd January, 2015.

ESCAP (2015). Making Data Count for All – Good Practices in Integrating Gender in National Statistical System, United Nations Economic and Social Commission for Asia and the Pacific (ESCAP).

Thomas, Helen et al., (2010), Gender Equality Results in ADB Projects: Mongolia Country Report, Mandaluyong city, Philippines, Asian Development Bank (ADB), 2010, ISBN: 978-92-9092-098-4.

IRIM and UNDP (2016), Mainstreaming, Acceleration and Policy Support (MAPS) for SDGS: Gender Baseline Analysis Against SDGS in Mongolia (Final Report), 30th April, 2016, Independent Research Institute of Mongolia and United Nations Development Programme of Mongolia.

JICA (2013), Country Gender Profile: Mongolia (Final Report), Japan International Cooperation Agency, INTEM Consulting, Inc. December 2013.

MEGDT (2014), Environment Sector Gender Strategy 2014-2030, Ministry of Environment Green Development and Tourism of Mongolia, 2014, Ulaanbaatar

MoF (2016), Mid-term Gender Strategy of the Minister of Finance 2016-2024, order number 144, 5th April, 2016, Minister of Finance of Mongolia.

Monfemnet. Situational analysis on access to sexual and reproductive health, 2015

MONES. Survey on sexual harassment in workplace, 2016

MoPDSP (2016), Gender Equality Policy Implementation in Mongolia, A speech from the Minister of the Population Development and Social Protection, May 2016.

NSO (2012), Time Use Survey: 2011, National Statistical Office of Mongolia, 2012, Ulaanbaatar.

NSO (2015), 2010 Population and Housing Census of Mongolia, Census Monograph, no.6, National Statistical Office of Mongolia, 2015 Ulaanbaatar.

NSO (2015), Labour Force Survey Report, National Statistical Office of Mongolia, 2015 Ulaanbaatar.

NSO (2015), Poverty Outlook 2014, National Statistical Office of Mongolia, 2015 Ulaanbaatar.

NSO, PAGE and ILO (2015), Employment in the Environment Sector and Green Jobs in Mongolia (Pilot Study), National Statistical Office of Mongolia, Partnership for Action on Green Economy, International Labour Organization, 2015, Ulaanbaatar.

NSO, PAGE and MEGDT (2015), Green Development Policy Indicators (Report), National Statistical Office of Mongolia, Partnership for Action on Green Economy, Ministry of Environment Green Development and Tourism of Mongolia, 2015, Ulaanbaatar.

NSO, UNFPA and UNICEF (2014), Mongolia Social Indicator Sample Survey (SISS) 2013, June, 2014 , National Statistical Office of Mongolia, United Nations Population Fund and United Nations Children's Fund.

OHCHR (2016) Status of Ratification Interactive Dashboard, Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights, accessed: 19 Sep 2016, available at: <http://indicators.ohchr.org/>.

SDC and IRIM (2014), Gender Overview – Mongolia A Desk Study, Swiss Agency for Development and Cooperation (SDC) and Independent Research Institute of Mongolia.

SDC and GG (2015), Gender Analysis in Pastoral Livestock Herding in Mongolia, Swiss Agency for Development and Cooperation (SDC) and Green Gold Project (GG) 2015, Ulaanbaatar.

UNIDO (2014), Guide on Gender Mainstreaming Energy and Climate Change Projects, United Nations Industrial Development Organization, Vienna, 2014.

UNRISD (2012), Gender in the Green Economy, United Nations Research Institute for Social Development (UNRISD), accessed 10th July, 2016, Available at: <http://www.unrisd.org/80256B3C005BE6B5/search/C9BAB159600EE0A5C1257A210036A71C>.

UN-WOMEN (2014), Gender Mainstreaming in Development Programming (Guidance Note), New York, November 2014, UN WOMEN.

UN-WOMEN (2014), World Survey on the Role of Women in Development 2014 – Gender Equality and Sustainable Development, UN-WOMEN, ISBN: 978-92-1-130330-8.

WB (2013) Mongolia: Gender Disparities in Labour Markets and Policy Suggestion, 10th May, 2013, Report number 77508, the World Bank (WB).

WEF (2016), Global Gender Gap Report 2015 Mongolia, World Economic Forum, accessed 01 Sep 2016, available at: <http://reports.weforum.org/global-gender-gap-report-2015/economies/#economy=MNG>,

ANNEX 2. SAMPLE QUESTIONNAIRE

This is sample questionnaire for assessment of line ministries and agencies (adopted from the UNIDO handbook on Gender Mainstreaming in Energy projects, 2014).

General Framework for the assessment of the particular sector	
Are there sectoral policies supporting or causing gender inequalities? Does your Ministry has a gender strategy?	
Is there a gender focal point in the Ministry?	
What is the most common division of labour in the sector by gender?	
Are there gender wage gaps between men and women working in the sector?	
How many small and medium enterprises are owned or managed by women in the sector?	
What are the barriers / challenges that reinforce gender inequalities? How might this affect different groups' ability to participate in sectoral initiatives / projects under the GDP	
What are initiatives, interventions in the sector that address gender issues?	
Will women's workload increase / decrease as a result if innovation and changes in technology in the sector If their workload is decreased, will this involve loss of income?	
How can women's awareness of rights, entitlements and opportunities be raised by your sector?	
Does the GDP policy or plan of the sector contribute to the education, training and professional development of women in sectoral issue (energy, forestry, agriculture, etc)	
Which activities address non-traditional roles of women such as marketing and promotion of women in science, technology, engineering ?	

Does the GDP design and NAP make clear commitment to contributing to gender equality (in its objectives, specific outputs and indicators)?	
--	--

ANNEX 3: LIST OF INTERVIEWEES

Organization	Names	Position
Ministries of Justice and Internal Affairs	Sh. Enkhjargal	Specialist, department of state administration
Ministry of Mining And Heavy Industry	G. Mungunzul	Specialist, department of state administration
Ministry of Health	T.Enkhzaya	Senior specialist, non- communicable diseases department
Ministry of Finance	Bolormaa	Specialist, department of state administration
Ministry of Construction and urban development	D. Erdenechimeg	Specialist, department of state administration
Ministry of Education, Culture and Science	Altantsetseg	Specialist, department of life long education
Ministry of Food, Agriculture, Light Industry	G.Narantsetseg	Senior specialist, department of state administration
Ministry of Population Development and Social Protection	Ch.Erdenechimeg	Specialist, department of family development, children, elderly youth
Ministry of Energy	E. Oyunchimeg	Specialist, department of state administration
Ministry of Road and Transport	Temuulee	Specialist, department of state administration
National Statistical Office	Altantulkhuur	Statistician, Department of Social statistics
Secretariat of the National Council on Gender, Ministry of Labour and Social Protection	Rentsenkhand	Specialist
Secretariat of the National Council on Gender, Ministry of Labour and Social Protection	Enkhbayar	Chief
Cabinet of Ministers	Enkhbayar	Advisor to Prime Minister

GENDER MAINSTREAMING IN GREEN DEVELOPMENT POLICY OF MONGOLIA

Asia Foundation	Enkhtuya	Gender officer
ADB	B.Tsolmon	Gender specialist
Mongolian Banker's Association	Nomin	Officer
MonFemNet	D.Sukhjargalma	Advisor to Monfemnet
National Center Against Violence	D.Eknhjargal	Director
Center for Human Rights and Development	DrG.Urantsooj	Chairperson
Mongolian Women's Fund	MsChinchuluun	Advisor to MONES